United States Senate election in New York, 2000

The United States Senate election in New York in 2000 was held on November 7, 2000. First Lady of the United States Hillary Rodham Clinton, the first First Lady to run for political office, defeated Congressman Rick Lazio. The general election coincided with the 2000 U.S. presidential election.

The race began in November 1998 when four-term incumbent New York Senator Daniel Patrick Moynihan announced his retirement. Both the Democratic Party and Republican Party sought high-profile candidates to compete for the open seat. By early 1999 Clinton and Mayor of New York City Rudolph Giuliani were the likely respective nominees. The lead in statewide polls swung from Clinton to Giuliani and back to Clinton as the campaigns featured successful strategies, mistakes, and dealing with current events. In late April and May 2000, Giuliani’s medical, romantic, marital, and political lives all collided in a tumultuous four-week period, culminating in his withdrawing from the race.

The Republicans chose lesser-known Congressman Rick Lazio to replace him. The election included a record $90 million in campaign expenditures between Clinton, Lazio, and Giuliani and national visibility. Clinton showed strength in normally Republican upstate areas and a debate blunder by Lazio solidified Clinton’s previously shaky support among women. Clinton won the election in November 2000 with 55 percent of the vote to Lazio’s 43 percent.

1 An open seat draws high-profile candidates

When four-term New York Senator Daniel Patrick Moynihan announced his retirement in November 1998, his previously safe Senate seat became open in the 2000 U.S. Senate election. Both parties tried to find high-profile candidates to run for it.

New York City Mayor Rudy Giuliani, who was prevented by term limits from running for mayoral reelection in 2001, immediately indicated interest. Due to his high profile and visibility, Giuliani was supported by the state Republican Party, even though he had irritated many by endorsing incumbent Democratic Governor Mario Cuomo over Republican George Pataki in 1994. Giuliani became the presumptive Republican nominee, and by April 1999 had formed a formal exploratory committee for a Senate run. There were still possible Republican primary opponents. Rick Lazio, a Congressman representing Suffolk County on Long Island, was raising money and had a candidacy announcement scheduled for August 16; he had openly discussed a primary against Giuliani, believing his more conservative record would be appealing to Republican primary voters. In early August, under pressure from state and national Republican figures, Pataki endorsed Giuliani. Pataki prevailed upon Lazio to forgo his candidacy, which Lazio agreed to despite frustration that Giuliani had still not officially announced that he was running: Lazio agreed to “If the mayor wants to be a candidate, I think he needs to get into this race. It’s time to put the soap opera aside and step up to the plate.” Nassau County Congressman Pete King also considered running and had raised some funds.

New York Congresswoman Nita Lowey was the candidate first expected to be the Democratic nominee, while other mentioned possible candidates included Secretary of Housing and Urban Development Andrew Cuomo, New York State Comptroller Carl McCall, and New York Congresswoman Carolyn Maloney. State Democratic figures were concerned that neither Lowey nor the others had the star power to rival Giuliani, and that the seat would be lost. Late in 1998, prominent Democratic politicians and advisors, including New York Representative Charles Rangel, urged First Lady Hillary Rodham Clinton to run for the New York Senate seat. An unprecedented action if she did it, Clinton spent considerable time mulling over the idea while Lowey waited in the wings. Her political advisors told her the race would be difficult and some of them told her she would lose. She waited for the impeachment proceedings of Bill Clinton to conclude, which it did with his acquittal on February 12, 1999.

2 The early Clinton campaign

On February 16, 1999, the First Lady’s office announced that she was considering running for the Senate position. Once it was clear Clinton was going to run, Lowey stepped aside, although she would be disappointed at the lost opportunity. On July 7, 1999, Clinton formally announced an exploratory committee for the Senate run; the setting was Moynihan’s farm in Pindars Cor-
nners, in rural Delaware County. Bill Clinton was less than enthusiastic about her candidacy. The staging of the event was brokered by the Clintons’ political consultant Mandy Grunwald. Hillary Clinton embarked upon a “listening tour” of all parts of New York after her entrance into the race. She planned to visit all 62 counties in New York, talking to New Yorkers in small-group settings according to the principles of retail politics. During the race, she spent considerable time campaigning in traditionally Republican upstate regions. Clinton faced charges of carpetbagging since she had never resided in the State of New York nor directly participated in state politics prior to her Senate race.

Meanwhile, in September 1999, the Clintons purchased a $1.7 million, 11-room, Dutch Colonial style home in Chappaqua, New York, north of New York City. Even the commonplace activity of house hunting leading up to this was the subject of considerable media attention; coverage of personal lives would be the norm in this contest of two “electricifying and polarizing figures” (as one reporter put it). In November 1999, Hillary Clinton announced that she would set aside most of her official duties as First Lady in order to take up residency in New York and pursue her campaign. Her move-in took place in January 2000, with the house furnished with many of the couple’s possessions from their Arkansas days. It became the first time since Woodrow Wilson’s first wife died in 1914 that a president lived in the White House without a spouse.

The early stages of her campaign were not without mistakes and as she later wrote, “Mistakes in New York politics aren’t easily brushed aside.” In a much-publicized move, Clinton donned a New York Yankees baseball cap at a June 1999 event when she had been a lifelong fan of the Chicago Cubs. This brought her much criticism, and Thomas Kuiper would later write an anti-Clinton book titled: I’ve Always Been a Yankees Fan: Hillary Clinton in Her Own Words. Clinton said she had to develop an anti-Clinton book titled: I’ve Always Been a Yankees Fan: Hillary Clinton in Her Own Words. Clinton said she had to develop an American League rooting interest, since fans of the Cubs were not expected to root for the American League Chicago White Sox. In her 2003 autobiography, she said that putting on the hat had been a “bad move”, but reiterated what had been reported in the press prior to the incident, that she had been “a die-hard Mickey Mantle fan; the book included a photograph of her with a Yankees cap on from 1992.

More seriously, on November 11, 1999, at the dedication of a U.S.-funded health program in the West Bank, she exchanged kisses with Suha Arafat, wife of Palestinian President Yasser Arafat, after Suha Arafat had delivered a speech claiming that Israel had deliberately poisoned Palestinians through environmental degradation and the use of “poisonous gas.” Some Israeli supporters said that Clinton never should have kissed the wife of the Palestinian leader, especially after such inflammatory remarks. The following day, Clinton denounced Suha Arafat’s allegations, and said that Palestinian negotiator Saeb Erekat had told her Suha Arafat had been referring to ‘ear gas’ and not ‘poison gas’. The kiss became a campaign issue, especially with Jewish voters. Clinton said it as a formality akin to a handshake, saying that to not have done so would have caused a diplomatic incident. Clinton later wrote that the live Arabic-to-English translation had failed to convey the accurate nature of her remarks: “Had I been aware of her hateful words, I would have denounced them on the spot.” Somewhat surprisingly, Clinton faced an erosion of support from women voters during her campaign, with her numbers declining throughout 1999. This was partly a typical pattern seen with women candidates where they have an early surge of female support, which then wears off, and it was partly due to her early campaign stumbles. But it also reflected the particular set of mixed feelings that women had towards Clinton’s marriage and the ambition and the power she derived from it. The problem was especially acute among some female demographics; one of her longtime advisers later said, “Women in the educated professional class? They fucking couldn’t stand her. We could never figure out why. We had psychologists come in.”

Clinton’s campaign to all counties, carried by a Ford conversion van, helped to defuse the carpetbagger issue with many New York residents saying that Clinton “seems like one of us.” She discussed local issues such as price supports for the dairy industry, fares for air travel, college tuition levels, and the brain drain in parts of the state. Her political positions were well matched to the different constituencies in the state that she targeted. In a January 2000 appearance on the Late Show with David Letterman, she established a rapport with the host that would continue throughout her Senate years and into her 2008 presidential campaign. Clinton formally announced her official candidacy in Purchase, New York in February 2000, adopting the simple name “Hillary” for her campaign literature.

Distrustful of the press since her husband’s 1992 presidential campaign and her early days as First Lady, she
imposed limits on her availability to the press van following her. Associated Press reporter Beth Harpaz later recounted a typical day from this time: “But we’d been told there’d be no ‘avail’ today, and we’d accepted it. That didn’t prevent me from feeling slightly humiliated. I was so worn down and so exasperated by the lack of access and the lack of news in this campaign that I’d given up fighting.”[35]

3 The early Giuliani campaign

An early January 1999 Marist Institute of Public Opinion poll showed Giuliani trailing Clinton by 10 points.[36] By January 2000, the Marist poll showed Giuliani up by 9 points.[36] Giuliani’s tactics involved intentionally baiting the Clinton campaign with deliberate overstatements, keeping them off balance and behind in the response cycle.[37] Giuliani emphasized his depiction of Clinton as a carpetbagger. He made a one-day visit to Little Rock, Arkansas, where he announced he would fly the Arkansas state flag over New York’s City Hall.[37] When Hillary Clinton visited New York from Washington, he said, “I hope she knows the way. I hope she doesn’t get lost on one of the side streets.”[37] Giuliani’s campaign prepared a 315-page opposition research dossier that went back to her time at Wellesley College; it included eleven pages of what they termed “Stupid Actions and Remarks”.[37] The Giuliani campaign had no problems raising money, getting over 40 percent of its funds from out-of-state and outraising Clinton overall two-to-one.[14]

The Giuliani campaign showed some structural weaknesses. So closely identified with New York City, he had somewhat limited appeal to naturally Republican voters in Upstate New York.[38] The Farmersville Garbage Scandal was indicative of his lower levels of support upstate.[38][39] By late December 1999, Clinton adapted to Giuliani’s psychological warfare, saying in response to one such gambit, “I can’t be responding every time the mayor gets angry. Because that’s all I would do.”[37] A February 2000 attempt by Giuliani to capitalize on a Clinton campaign event’s accidental playing of Billy Joel’s suburban drug tale “Captain Jack”[40] led to more ridicule for him than for her.[14]

On March 11, 2000, Giuliani and Clinton met face-to-face for the first time since the campaigning began, at the New York Inner Circle press dinner, an annual event in which New York politicians and the press corps stage skits, roast each other and make fun of themselves, with proceeds going to charity.[41] Giuliani was on stage in male disco garb spoofing John Travolta in Saturday Night Fever, but also appeared in drag in taped video clips that reworked the “Rudy/Rudia” theme of a past Inner Circle dinner,[42] as well as in an exchange with Joan Rivers that sought to make fun of Clinton.[43] Other performers’ skits made fun of Clinton’s Yankees claim and the infidelity of her husband.[43]

The New York Police Department’s fatal shooting of Patrick Dorismond on March 15, 2000 inflamed Giuliani’s already strained relations with the city’s minority communities,[33] and Clinton seized on it as a major campaign issue.[33] By April, reports showed Clinton gaining upstate and generally outworking Giuliani, who stated that his duties as mayor prevented him from campaigning more.[44] He gave priority to city duties over campaign activities.[37] Some Giuliani aides and national Republican figures concluded that his interest in the campaign was flagging, as although he was desirous of winning in political combat against a Clinton, he was by nature an executive personality and the prospect of serving as one of a hundred legislators was unappealing to him.[37]

By this time, Clinton was 8 to 10 points ahead of Giuliani in the polls.[33][45] In retrospect, The New York Times would write that the battle so far between the two had comprised “a blistering year of mental gamesmanship, piercing attacks, contrasts in personalities and positions, and blunders, played out by two outsize political figures in a super-heated atmosphere.”[37]

4 A tumultuous four weeks

Giuliani’s marriage to his wife, broadcast journalist and actress Donna Hanover, had been distant since 1996, and the two were rarely seen in public together.[46] There had been no formal announcement of any change in their relationship, although Hanover had indicated that she and their children would not move to Washington if Giuliani won the race.[47] Beginning in October 1999, a new woman was being spotted at mayoral functions.[48] By March 2000, Giuliani had stopped wearing his wedding ring[46] and was being seen more in the company of this other woman, including at the Inner Circle press dinner, the St. Patrick’s Day parade, and town hall meetings, but it was not yet fully clear whether the relationship was personal or professional.[49][50] While this woman had become a frequent subject of insider talk among the New York political circle, she had not been mentioned in the press.[48]

On April 20 Hanover announced that she would soon be taking over the lead role in Eve Ensler’s controversial play The Vagina Monologues.[51] Political observers speculated that Hanover was partly engaging in a political act against her husband, as Ensler was a friend and supporter of Hillary Clinton[51] and the role would not go over well with social conservatives within the Republican Party. Giuliani declined to say whether he would attend one of her performances.[52] On April 22, the New York Post obtained photographs of Giuliani openly strolling on a Manhattan street with the other woman after they left a restaurant, but did not have more than a first name for her:[49][53] the Post sat on the story, but it was clear the relationship was a personal one.[49]
On April 26, television channel NY1 reported that Giuliani had undergone a second round of tests for prostate cancer at Mount Sinai Medical Center; the same disease had led to the death of his father. On April 28, Giuliani held a news conference to announce that he did in fact have prostate cancer, but it was in an early stage. He was unsure of which of several types of treatment he might undergo, and that decision would impact whether he could stay in the senate race or not. Hanover was not present at the conference, but issued a note saying she would support him in his decision process.

As Giuliani mulled over his medical options, on May 1 Hanover announced that she was postponing her appearance in The Vagina Monologues due to “personal family circumstances.” On May 2 the New York Daily News published a brief item about Giuliani’s other woman, without name or description. On May 3 the New York Post finally published its photographs of Giuliani and the woman, now identified as Judith Nathan, leaving a restaurant together. Under the front page headline “Rudy’s Mystery Brunch Pal is Upper East Side Divorcée,” (Some observers felt that Giuliani, known for his ability to manipulate the New York media, had been eager for news of the relationship to come out.) Later that day, Giuliani responded to a barrage of questions on the subject at a news conference by acknowledging Judith Nathan publicly for the first time, calling her “a very good friend” and expressing his annoyance that her privacy was being invaded.

The next days were filled with New York media coverage on Nathan’s background and on the relationship. On May 6 Hanover held an unusually-located news conference at the back of St. Patrick’s Cathedral before the funeral of Cardinal John O’Connor; visibly trembling, she said, “I will be supportive of Rudy in his fight against his illness, as this marriage and this man have been very precious to me.” The following day half the press tried to stake out Nathan’s known locations while the rest pestered Nathan’s staff member. On May 8, Giuliani canceled campaigning and fundraising trips to upstate New York and California; on May 12, they were trailed by a flock of photographers. Giuliani canceled campaigning and fundraising trips to upstate New York and California; on May 12, they were trailed by a flock of photographers. Giuliani canceled campaigning and fundraising trips to upstate New York and California; on May 12, they were trailed by a flock of photographers. Giuliani canceled campaigning and fundraising trips to upstate New York and California; on May 12, they were trailed by a flock of photographers. Giuliani canceled campaigning and fundraising trips to upstate New York and California; on May 12, they were trailed by a flock of photographers. Giuliani canceled campaigning and fundraising trips to upstate New York and California; on May 12, they were trailed by a flock of photographers. Giuliani canceled campaigning and fundraising trips to upstate New York and California; on May 12, they were trailed by a flock of photographers. Giuliani canceled campaigning and fundraising trips to

State Republican leaders, who until now had avoided talk of replacements for Giuliani should he not run, now gave more attention to the matter, with the state party convention coming up on May 30. Former possible contenders Rick Lazio and Pete King immediately indicated they were available; other names mentioned included Wall Street financier Theodore J. Forstmann and Governor Pataki, although the latter indicated no interest. Giuliani continued to ponder his senate race decision; when he had dinner with Nathan on May 12, they were trailed by a flock of photographers. Giuliani canceled campaigning and fundraising trips to upstate New York and California; on May 13, suggesting he would not run, but then resumed fundraising and suggested he was inclined towards running on May 15. Two Republican county chairmen became upset at the indecision, saying, “Like Waiting for Godot, we have Waiting for Rudy,” and, “We need a decision. Like tomorrow would be nice. Because this is getting ridiculous.” A top state Republican said, “He seem[s] to like the attention. He seems to be going through some sort of catharsis in public. And we’re like psychiatrists watching it. I can’t quite figure it out. I don’t think anybody can.”

Clinton, meanwhile, said as little as possible about the situation, preferring to let Giuliani’s drama play out on its own. On May 17, as he huddled with his doctors over whether to choose surgery or radiation as his treatment while facing conflicting political advice from his aides, she won the unanimous approval of delegates to the Democratic Party state convention at the Pepsi Arena in Albany, New York, giving a constrained acceptance speech because she did not know her general election opponent.

Finally, on May 19, Giuliani held what The New York Times described as an “extraordinary, emotional news conference” in Bryant Park to announce that he was seeking a separation from Hanover, saying, “This is very, very painful. For quite some time it’s been very apparent that Donna and I lead in many ways independent and separate lives.” Regarding Nathan, Giuliani said “I’m going to need her now more than maybe I did before,” making reference to his battle with cancer and her background in nursing. Regarding the senate race, he again did not commit to a decision, saying, “I don’t really care about politics right now. I’m thinking about my family, the people that I love and what can be done that’s honest and truthful and that protects them the best. I’m not thinking about politics. Politics comes at least second, maybe third, maybe fourth, somewhere else. It’ll all work itself out some way politically.” Giuliani had, however, neglected to inform Hanover in advance of his announcement; her reaction was described as distraught.

Three hours later, she held her own news conference at Gracie Mansion, where she said, “Today’s turn of events brings me great sadness. I had hoped to keep this marriage together. For several years, it was difficult to participate in Rudy’s public life because of his relationship with one staff member.” In this, she was making reference to Cristyne Lategano, the former communications director for Giuliani; Vanity Fair had reported in 1997 that Lategano and Giuliani were having an affair, which both of them had denied. Hanover continued, “Beginning last May, I made a major effort to bring us back together. Rudy and I re-established some of our personal intimacy through the fall. At that point, he chose another path.”

State Republican leaders, who until now had avoided talk of replacements for Giuliani should he not run, now gave more attention to the matter, with the state party convention coming up on May 30. Former possible contenders Rick Lazio and Pete King immediately indicated they were available; other names mentioned included Wall Street financier Theodore J. Forstmann and Governor Pataki, although the latter indicated no interest. Giuliani continued to ponder his senate race decision; when he had dinner with Nathan on May 12, they were trailed by a flock of photographers. Giuliani canceled campaigning and fundraising trips to upstate New York and California; on May 13, suggesting he would not run, but then resumed fundraising and suggested he was inclined towards running on May 15. Two Republican county chairmen became upset at the indecision, saying, “Like Waiting for Godot, we have Waiting for Rudy,” and, “We need a decision. Like tomorrow would be nice. Because this is getting ridiculous.” A top state Republican said, “He seem[s] to like the attention. He seems to be going through some sort of catharsis in public. And we’re like psychiatrists watching it. I can’t quite figure it out. I don’t think anybody can.”

Clinton, meanwhile, said as little as possible about the situation, preferring to let Giuliani’s drama play out on its own. On May 17, as he huddled with his doctors over whether to choose surgery or radiation as his treatment while facing conflicting political advice from his aides, she won the unanimous approval of delegates to the Democratic Party state convention at the Pepsi Arena in Albany, New York, giving a constrained acceptance speech because she did not know her general election opponent.

Finally, on May 19, Giuliani held what The New York Times described as an “extraordinary, emotional news conference” in Bryant Park to announce that he was seeking a separation from Hanover, saying, “This is very, very painful. For quite some time it’s been very apparent that Donna and I lead in many ways independent and separate lives.” Regarding Nathan, Giuliani said “I’m going to need her now more than maybe I did before,” making reference to his battle with cancer and her background in nursing. Regarding the senate race, he again did not commit to a decision, saying, “I don’t really care about politics right now. I’m thinking about my family, the people that I love and what can be done that’s honest and truthful and that protects them the best. I’m not thinking about politics. Politics comes at least second, maybe third, maybe fourth, somewhere else. It’ll all work itself out some way politically.” Giuliani had, however, neglected to inform Hanover in advance of his announcement; her reaction was described as distraught.

Three hours later, she held her own news conference at Gracie Mansion, where she said, “Today’s turn of events brings me great sadness. I had hoped to keep this marriage together. For several years, it was difficult to participate in Rudy’s public life because of his relationship with one staff member.” In this, she was making reference to Cristyne Lategano, the former communications director for Giuliani; Vanity Fair had reported in 1997 that Lategano and Giuliani were having an affair, which both of them had denied. Hanover continued, “Beginning last May, I made a major effort to bring us back together. Rudy and I re-established some of our personal intimacy through the fall. At that point, he chose another path.”

State Republican leaders, who until now had avoided talk of replacements for Giuliani should he not run, now gave more attention to the matter, with the state party convention coming up on May 30. Former possible contenders Rick Lazio and Pete King immediately indicated they were available; other names mentioned included Wall Street financier Theodore J. Forstmann and Governor Pataki, although the latter indicated no interest. Giuliani continued to ponder his senate race decision; when he had dinner with Nathan on May 12, they were trailed by a flock of photographers. Giuliani canceled campaigning and fundraising trips to upstate New York and California; on May 13, suggesting he would not run, but then resumed fundraising and suggested he was inclined towards running on May 15. Two Republican county chairmen became upset at the indecision, saying, “Like Waiting for Godot, we have Waiting for Rudy,” and, “We need a decision. Like tomorrow would be nice. Because this is getting ridiculous.” A top state Republican said, “He seem[s] to like the attention. He seems to be going through some sort of catharsis in public. And we’re like psychiatrists watching it. I can’t quite figure it out. I don’t think anybody can.”

Clinton, meanwhile, said as little as possible about the situation, preferring to let Giuliani’s drama play out on its own. On May 17, as he huddled with his doctors over whether to choose surgery or radiation as his treatment while facing conflicting political advice from his aides, she won the unanimous approval of delegates to the Democratic Party state convention at the Pepsi Arena in Albany, New York, giving a constrained acceptance speech because she did not know her general election opponent.
humanity you realize that, that the core of you is first of all being able to take care of your health." He said that he would instead devote the remainder of his mayoralty trying to overcome the hostile relations he had with many of the city’s minority groups.

5  A change of Republicans: Lazio

After Giuliani withdrew in May 2000, lesser-known Long Island Congressman Rick Lazio took his place.

While previous Republican nominee candidates and fellow Long Island Congressmen Rick Lazio and Pete King had both indicated an interest in replacing Giuliani, upon Giuliani’s withdrawal the state party quickly rallied around Lazio, who had more campaign funds and who was viewed as a potentially strong candidate. In particular, Governor Pataki — who never cared much for Giuliani to begin with — was strongly in favor of Lazio, and praised him as “fresh, unencumbered challenger” to Clinton. This also caused a shuffle in New York’s unique third-party ballot-line alignments: the Liberal Party of New York, which was previously set to run Giuliani (whom they had supported in all three of his mayoral races), now switched to Clinton, while the Conservative Party of New York, which had previously been loath to endorse the socially liberal Giuliani (and was set to nominate former Westchester Congressman Joe DioGuardi) lined up behind Lazio. Lazio accepted the unanimous approval of delegates to the Republican Party state convention at a hotel ballroom in Buffalo on May 30.

Clinton now faced a lesser-known candidate in Lazio. While a relative moderate among House Republicans, Lazio had frequently supported former House Speaker Newt Gingrich, an largely despised figure among many New Yorkers. Lazio did bring to the table an ethnic suburban background familiar to many New Yorkers, and had a reputation as an energetic campaigner.

One formality left were New York’s late-in-the-season primary elections on September 12, which in this case merely served to ratify the state party conventions’ choices. Lazio won unopposed, while Clinton won 82 percent of the vote in easily defeating unknown Manhattan doctor Mark McMahon, who ran on the grounds that “the Clintons have tried to hijack the Democratic Party.” For her part, Clinton said that she was “surprised, in a way [to see her name in the voting booth]. I stood there for a minute, staring at my name.” In any case, the general election was already well underway.

6  Republican primary

6.1 Polling

7  General election

7.1 Polling

8  General election campaign

The contest drew considerable national attention and both candidates were well-funded. By the end of the race, Democrat Clinton and Republicans Lazio and Giuliani had spent a combined $90 million, the most of any U.S. Senate race in history. Lazio outspent Clinton $40 million to $29 million, with Clinton also getting several million dollars in soft money from Democratic organizations. Among Clinton antagonists circles, direct mail-based fundraising groups such as the Emergency Committee to Stop Hillary Rodham Clinton sprung up, sending out solicitations with apoplectic visions of: just as one Clinton leaves office, another gains office.

Clinton secured a broad base of support, including endorsements from conservation groups and organized labor, but notably not the New York City police and firefighters’ unions, which endorsed Lazio. While Clinton had a solid base of support in New York City, candidates and observers expected the race to be decided in upstate New York where 45 percent of the state’s voters live. During the campaign, Clinton vowed to improve the economic picture in upstate New York, promising that her plan would deliver 200,000 New York jobs over six years. Her plan included specific tax credits with the purpose of rewarding job creation and encouraging business investment, especially in the high-tech sector. She called for targeted personal tax cuts for college tuition and long-
term care. Lazio faced a unique tactical problem campaigning upstate. The major issue there was the persistently weak local economy, which Lazio hoped to link to his opponent’s husband’s tenure in office. Attacks on the state of the upstate economy were frequently interpreted as criticism of incumbent Republican governor George Pataki, however, limiting the effect of this line of attack.

Opponents continued to make the carpetbagging issue a focal point throughout the race and during debates. Talk radio hammered on this, with New York-based Sean Hannity issuing a daily mantra, “Name me three things Hillary Clinton has ever done for the people of New York!” Clinton’s supporters pointed out that the state was receptive to national leaders, such as Robert F. Kennedy who was elected to the Senate in 1964 despite similar accusations. In the end, according to exit polls conducted in the race, a majority of the voters dismissed the carpetbagging issue as unimportant.

During the campaign, Independent Counsel Robert Ray filed his final reports regarding the long-running Whitewater, “Travelgate”, and “Filegate” investigations of the White House, each of which included specific investigations of Hillary Clinton actions. The reports exonerated her on the files matter, said there was insufficient evidence regarding her role in Whitewater, and said that she had made factually false statements regarding the Travel Office firings but there was insufficient evidence to prosecute her. Although The New York Times editorialized that the release of the reports seemed possibly timed to coincide with the Senate election, in practice the findings were not seen as likely to sway many voters’ opinions.

A September 13, 2000 debate between Lazio and Clinton proved important. Lazio was on the warpath against soft money and the amounts of it coming from the Democratic National Committee into Clinton’s campaign, and challenged Clinton to agree to ban soft money from both campaigns. He left his podium and waved his proposed paper agreement in Clinton’s face; many debate viewers thought he had invaded her personal space and as a result Clinton’s support among women voters solidified.

Late in the campaign Lazio criticised Clinton for accepting campaign donations from various Arab groups in the wake of the USS Cole attack. This issue caused former New York Mayor Ed Koch to take out ads telling Lazio to “stop with the sleaze already,” and did not change the dynamic of the race.

9 Results

Per New York State law, Clinton and Lazio totals include their minor party line votes: Liberal Party of New York and Working Families Party for Clinton, Conservative Party for Lazio.

Clinton won the election on November 7 with 55% of the vote to Lazio’s 43%, a difference larger than most observers had expected. Clinton won the traditionally Democratic base of New York City by large margins, and carried suburban Westchester County, but lost heavily populated Long Island, part of which Lazio represented in Congress. She won surprising victories in upstate counties, such as Cayuga, Rensselaer, and Niagara, to which her win has been attributed.

In comparison with other results, this 12% margin was smaller than Gore’s 25% margin over Bush in the state Presidential contest, was slightly larger than the 10% margin by which fellow New York senator Charles Schumer defeated incumbent Republican Al D’Amato in the hotly contested 1998 race, but was considerably smaller than the 47% margin by which Senator Schumer won reelection in 2004 against little-known Republican challenger Howard Mills. The victory of a Democrat in the Senate election was not assured, because in recent decades the Republicans had won about half the elections for governor and senator.

Lazio’s bid was handicapped by the weak performance of George W. Bush in New York in the 2000 election, but it is also clear Hillary Clinton had made substantial inroads in upstate New York prior to Lazio’s entry into the
Exit polls also showed a large gender gap with Clinton running stronger than expected among moderate women and unaffiliated women. \[104\]

## 10 Post-election charges

### 10.1 Hasidic pardons

In January 2001, two months after Hillary Clinton’s election to the Senate, President Clinton pardoned four residents of the New Square Hasidic enclave in Rockland County, New York, who had been convicted of defrauding the federal government of $30 million by establishing a fictitious religious school. \[105\][106\] New Square had voted almost unanimously for Hillary Clinton in the New York Senate race. A lawyer following the matter stated that even if Hillary Clinton had promised to lobby her husband for clemency in exchange for the town’s votes — a claim for which there was no proof — it would be difficult to establish a crime had taken place: “Politicians make promises all the time. That’s nothing new — or illegal.” \[105\] Hillary Clinton acknowledged sitting in on a post-election meeting discussing possible clemency for the four, but said she had played no part in her husband’s decision. \[106\]

A federal investigation launched to investigate various Clinton pardons, \[105\] closed its investigation of the New Square matter in June 2002 by taking no action against Bill Clinton, Hillary Clinton, or any residents of New Square. \[107\]

### 10.2 Hollywood fundraiser

Hillary Clinton’s former finance director, David Rosen, was indicted on January 7, 2005 on campaign finance charges related to a fund-raising event produced by Peter F. Paul. Paul, a convicted drug dealer who would soon after be convicted on stock fraud charges after being extradited from Brazil, stated that he spent $1.2 million to produce the August 12, 2000 Hollywood Gala Salute to President William Jefferson Clinton event, which was both a tribute to honor President Clinton and a fundraiser for the First Lady’s 2000 Senate campaign. The Justice Department indictment charged Rosen with filing false reports with the Federal Election Commission by reporting only $400,000 in contributions. On May 27, 2005, the jury acquitted Rosen on all counts. \[108\] On January 5, 2006 it was reported that Clinton’s campaign group agreed to pay a $35,000 fine related to the underreporting of the fundraiser’s expenses. \[109\]

Peter Paul has also filed a civil suit in this matter, Paul v. Clinton. \[110\] On April 10, 2006, the judge in charge of the case removed Hillary Clinton as a defendant, citing a lack of evidence. However, she may still be called to testify as a witness in the case. \[111\] The removal was upheld by the California Second District Court of Appeal on October 16, 2007. \[112\]

Meanwhile, by the time of Hillary Clinton’s 2008 presidential campaign, a 13-minute video produced by Paul and describing his various allegations against Hillary Clinton had become quite popular on the Internet, gaining 1.4 million hits on Google Video and about 350,000 on YouTube in a single week in October 2007. \[113\]

## 11 Legacy

Clinton’s victory would establish her as an effective campaigner and an electoral force on her own, able to capture Republican and independent votes and overcome her polarizing image. \[101\] She would easily win re-election in 2006, and in 2007 began her presidential campaign for 2008.

Lazio gave up his House seat to run for Senate. Following his defeat, which set a record for the most money spent in a losing Senate effort, \[102\] he took positions in the corporate world and avoided electoral politics until becoming a candidate in New York’s 2010 gubernatorial election. \[114\] However, he was defeated by a wide margin in the Republican primary. \[115\]

Giuliani would undergo treatment for his cancer and eventually recover; he would also divorce Donna Hanover and eventually marry Judith Nathan. After his campaign withdrawal, his political future looked uncertain at best. \[114\] But less than a year after the senate general election, the September 11, 2001 terrorist attacks took place, with Giuliani still mayor. Giuliani’s performance in the aftermath of September 11 earned him many accolades and resurrected his political prospects. \[116\] After a successful stint in the private sector, in 2007 he also began...
Throughout much of 2007, Clinton and Giuliani led in national polls for their parties’ respective nominations, and media reports often looked back to the 2000 “race that wasn’t” as a preview of what might lie in wait for the entire nation in 2008.[14][17] Such extrapolating ended with the Giuliani campaign’s precipitous decline and January 2008 withdrawal. Clinton as well failed to gain the 2008 nomination and, in June 2008, she finished in a close second place to Illinois Senator Barack Obama.

In December 2008, Lowey would have another chance at the Senate seat, when Clinton was nominated for U.S. Secretary of State by President-elect Obama and Lowey was considered a front-runner to be named as her appointed replacement.[117] But Lowey withdrew from consideration, as in the intervening years she had gained enough seniority to become one of the powerful “cardinals” on the House Appropriations Committee and did not want to relinquish that position.[117] When Caroline Kennedy announced her interest in the vacancy, comparisons were drawn to Clinton in 2000, with both being famous people seeking to hold elective office for the first time.[118] Others pointed out that Clinton had won election to the office while Kennedy would first be appointed.[119] In any case, Kennedy’s effort soon faltered, in part due to not having the same desire or willingness to work for the seat as Clinton had had,[120] and she soon withdrew as abruptly as she had entered.[121]

Kirsten Gillibrand received the appointment, and attention then turned to who would run against her in the 2010 Senate special election. By November 2009, Gillibrand was seriously considering a run for his old would-have-been Senate seat,[122] but the following month he announced he was not running for it or anything else in 2010, possibly signalling an end to his political career.[123][124]

12 References


[29] Living History, pp. 509-510.


[32] Bernstein, A Woman in Charge, p. 542


[53] Barrett, Rudy!, p. 437.


[58] Barrett, Rudy!, p. 436.


13 Text and image sources, contributors, and licenses

13.1 Text

- United States Senate election in New York, 2000
  
  

13.2 Images

- File:ClintonSenate.jpg
  
  **Source:** https://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/commons/1/10/ClintonSenate.jpg
  
  **License:** Public domain
  
  **Contributors:** http://www.access.gpo.gov/nara/pubpaps/2000portv3.html
  
  **Original artist:** Unknown

- File:Flag_of_New_York.svg
  
  **Source:** https://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/commons/1/1a/Flag_of_New_York.svg
  
  **License:** Public domain
  
  **Contributors:** xmap flag collection 2.7
  
  **Original artist:** State of New York

- File:Giuliani_closeup.jpg
  
  **Source:** https://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/commons/6/60/Giuliani_closeup.jpg
  
  **License:** Public domain
  
  **Contributors:** Cropped from w:Image:Bedrick with Giuliani.jpg
  
  **Original artist:** Crzrussian, cropped by Angr

- File:Hillary_Clinton_and_her_largest_donor_Peter_Paul.jpg
  
  **Source:** https://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/commons/b/b1/Hillary_Clinton_and_her_largest_donor_Peter_Paul.jpg
  
  **License:** CC-BY-SA-3.0
  
  **Contributors:** Peter F Paul's collection
  
  **Original artist:** Andrea Paul

- File:Hillary_Rodham_Clinton-cropped.jpg
  
  **Source:** https://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/commons/b/bb/Hillary_Rodham_Clinton-cropped.jpg
  
  **License:** Public domain
  
  **Contributors:** http://clinton.senate.gov/about/photos/
  
  **Original artist:** United States Senate.

- File:Hillaryandsuha.jpg
  
  **Source:** https://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/en/2/28/Hillaryandsuha.jpg
  
  **License:** ?
  
  **Contributors:** ?
  
  **Original artist:** ?

- File:NYSen00Counties.png
  
  **Source:** https://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/commons/4/47/NYSen00Counties.png
  
  **License:** CC BY-SA 3.0
  
  **Contributors:** Map of New York County Outlines.svg
  
  **Original artist:** Hekerui

- File:Rick_Lazio.jpg
  
  **Source:** https://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/en/5/54/Rick_Lazio.jpg
  
  **License:** PD
  
  **Contributors:** Rick Lazio's Congressional Web site, 1999
  
  **Original artist:** Rick Lazio

- File:Ricklazio.jpg
  
  **Source:** https://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/commons/1/12/Ricklazio.jpg
  
  **License:** Public domain
  
  **Contributors:** on http://bioguide.congress.gov/scripts/biodisplay.pl?index=L000155
  
  **Original artist:** ?

- File:Seal_of_New_York.svg
  
  **Source:** https://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/commons/c/ca/Seal_of_New_York.svg
  
  **License:** Public domain
  
  **Contributors:** Own work, center image extracted from N.Y. flag, and altered to fit the seal.
  
  **Original artist:** United States.

- File:Symbol_book_class2.svg
  
  **Source:** https://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/commons/8/89/Symbol_book_class2.svg
  
  **License:** CC BY-SA 2.5
  
  **Contributors:** Mad by Lokal_Profil by combining:
  
  **Original artist:** Lokal_Profil

13.3 Content license

- Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 3.0